Leadership to Support Evidence-Based and Innovative Practices

Gregory A. Aarons, Ph.D.\textsuperscript{1,3}
Mark G. Ehrhart, Ph.D.\textsuperscript{2}
Lauren R. Dlugosz, B.A.\textsuperscript{1,3}

\textsuperscript{1}University of California, School of Medicine
\textsuperscript{2}San Diego State University, Department of Psychology
\textsuperscript{3}Child & Adolescent Services Research Center
Acknowledgements

• Funding
  ◦ National Institute of Mental Health
  ◦ Centers for Disease Control

• Collaboration
  ◦ California Institute for Mental Health
  ◦ Foster School of Management
    • University of Washington
  ◦ The Wharton School
    • University of Pennsylvania
Agenda

• Introductions
• Capitalizing on effective leadership to implement evidence-based practices
• The importance of leadership in health services
• Full Range Leadership Model
• Implementation climate
• Applying leadership to implementation
• Implementation leadership training (LEAP)
CAPITALIZING ON EFFECTIVE LEADERSHIP TO IMPLEMENT EVIDENCE-BASED PRACTICES
17 years after discovery - only 14 percent of original research benefits patient care

Original Research

Negative results 18\%^1

Submission

Negative results 46\%^3

Acceptance

Publication

Lack of numbers 35\%^4

Bibliographic Databases

Inconsistent Indexing 50\%^6

Reviews Guidelines Textbooks

IMPLEMENTATION

Balas & Boren, 2000; ¹ Dickersin, 1987; ² Kumar, 1992; ³ Koren, 1989; ⁴ Balas, 1995; ⁵ Poyer, 1982; ⁶ Poynard, 1985; ⁷ Antman, 1992
Why Examine Leadership and EBP Implementation

- Growing (mature?) momentum to implement EBPs into real world practice
- Determine what factors can support implementation that improves care
- Comprehensive approaches to implement EBPs more effectively are needed
Leadership & EBP Implementation: Local, National, International Concern

• EBP Implementation in Four Countries
  ◦ (Brazil, Israel, Lebanon, Egypt)
  ◦ World Psychiatric Association
  ◦ Integrated Services Task Force¹

• Identified Leadership as Important
  ◦ Leadership support
  ◦ Support by management staff²

• “There was agreement across the sites on several items, including the importance of leadership support”

• “Directors were able to exert high quality leadership and guidance to the [implementation] project, even when formidable obstacles …occurred”

• “Early adoption and guidance [facilitated] by innovative leaders”

¹ Hoagwood, Kelleher, Murray, et al., 2006; ² Klein et al.
THE IMPORTANCE OF LEADERSHIP IN HEALTH SERVICES
Factors Affecting Implementation

- Research & Outcomes Supporting EBP
- Beneficial features (of EBP)
- System Readiness & Compatibility
- Political Dynamics
- Funding
- Costs of EBP
- Agency Compatibility
- EBP Limitations
- Leadership
- Clinician Perceptions
- Staff Development & Support
- Staffing Resources
- Consumer Concerns
- Impact on Clinical Practice
- Consumer Values & Marketing
- Source: Aarons (2008)
## How Important and Changeable is Leadership for EBP?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Importance Ranking</th>
<th>Changeability Ranking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Leadership</td>
<td>1. Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Funding</td>
<td>2. Clinical perceptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Staff Dev/Support</td>
<td>3. Consumer values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Staff resources</td>
<td>4. Staff Dev/Support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Costs</td>
<td>5. Impact on clinical practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Beneficial EBP features</td>
<td>7. Consumer concerns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Political dynamics</td>
<td>8. Agency compatibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Consumer values</td>
<td>10. Staff resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Impact on clinical practice</td>
<td>13. EBP limitations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. EBP limitations</td>
<td>14. Costs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Agency compatibility</td>
<td>15. Funding</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Leadership’s Multiple Impacts
Effects of Leadership in Health Services

- **Nurses**
  - Productivity, Organizational Commitment, Job Satisfaction
  - Patient Satisfaction with Care

- **Cardiac Surgery Teams**
  - Leadership, implementation of EBP

- **Mental Health Services Teams**
  - Working Alliance
  - Job Satisfaction, Organizational Commitment, Perceptions of Job Tasks
  - Emotional Exhaustion, Depersonalization, Personal Accomplishment
  - Attitudes toward EBP
  - Importance of Leadership during Implementation
  - Patient Satisfaction and Quality of Life

---

1 Edmonson, Bohmer, Pisano, 2001; 2 Aarons, et al; (2002); 3 Aarons, 2006; 4 Aarons and Sommerfeld, In Review; 5 Corrigan et al., 2000
Leadership Effects in Healthcare

Leadership associated with:

- Nurse Productivity,
- Organizational Commitment
- Job Satisfaction

- Patient satisfaction with care

Leader Support of Interdisciplinary Teams for Minimally Invasive Cardiac Surgery

Open heart surgery vs. minimally invasive (incision between ribs) surgery

Organization Context
- Resources
- Information
- Organizational support
- Innovation history

Team Leadership
- Motivating input
- Minimize power differences

Team Learning Process
- Ease of speaking up
- Boundary spanning
- Practice and reflection

Implementation
Success
Leadership, Organizational Climate and Working Alliance

- 332 Mental health clinicians and case managers

Source: Aarons, Woodbridge et al; (2002)
Multilevel Mediational Model of Leadership, Organizational Climate, and Working Alliance
Service Provider Satisfaction, Commitment, and Job Characteristics

- 22 Human Services Organizations

- Leadership is associated with:
  - Job Satisfaction
  - Organizational Commitment
  - Role Conflict
  - Role Ambiguity
  - Task Identity
  - Task Significance

Work Stress and Burnout

• Adult Mental Health Service Teams

• Leadership Associated with:
  ◦ Emotional Exhaustion
  ◦ Depersonalization
  ◦ Personal Accomplishment

Corrigan, Diwan, Campion, Rashid, 2002
Provider Attitudes toward Adopting EBP

- 303 public-sector mental health service clinicians providing services to children, adolescents and their families

**Leadership Associated With:**

- Openness to trying new practices
- Willingness to adopt if a practice is required
- Overall attitudes toward EBP

Aarons, 2006
When are Different Types of Leadership is Important?

\[ \chi^2(4)=1.105; \; p=.894; \; CFI=1.000, \; TLI=1.037, \; RMSEA=0.000, \; SRMR=0.013; \; *p<.05, \; **p<.01, \; ***p<.001 \]

Aarons & Sommerfeld (In Review)
Patient Satisfaction and Quality of Life

- 68 teams providing services to persons with severe and persistent mental illness

- Leadership Associated with:
  - Consumer Satisfaction
  - Consumer Quality of Life

Corrigan, P. W., Lickey, S. E., Campion, J., Rashid, F. (2001)
So… Leadership is Important!

- Productivity
- Working alliance
- Job satisfaction
- Organizational commitment
- Perceptions of job tasks
- Staff morale (emotional exhaustion)
- Staff attitudes toward EBP
- Consumer satisfaction and quality of life
- Importance of leadership during implementation
Activity

IDENTIFYING EFFECTIVE LEADERSHIP
What is Effective Leadership?

- Think of someone you have worked with that you consider to be an effective leader.

- What are the characteristics or behaviors this person exhibited that contributed to their effective leadership?
FULL RANGE MODEL OF LEADERSHIP
The Full Range Leadership Model\textsuperscript{1,2,3}

- **Credentials**
  - Focused on organizational change
  - Evidence for effectiveness
  - Established training materials
  - Values based/appropriate for mental health settings

- **3 Major Components**
  - Transformational leadership
  - Transactional leadership
  - Non-leadership

\textsuperscript{1Bass, 1985; 2Bass, 1999; 3Bass & Avolio, 1994}
Transformational Leadership

- Leader motivates followers through the enactment of positive values

- Emphasis on inspiration and appealing to higher-order needs to gain “performance beyond expectations”

- Shown to be effective in health/mental health settings\(^1,^2\)

\(^1\)Corrigan, Diwan, Campion & Rashid, 2002; \(^2\)Gilmartin & D’Aunno, 2007
Transformational Leadership

• Individualized Consideration
  ◦ Identifies staff member’s individual strengths, weaknesses, and needs
  ◦ Uses individualized strategies to communicate with and motivate staff members
Transformational Leadership

- Intellectual Stimulation
  - Encourages staff members to think about things in new ways
  - Creates an environment that is safe for questioning
Transformational Leadership

• Inspirational Motivation
  ◦ Presents an attainable and desirable vision of the future
  ◦ Articulates the values of the organization
  ◦ Helps followers place specific actions in the context of the larger goals
Transformational Leadership

- Idealized Influence
  - Demonstrates ethical behavior
  - Serves as a role model for followers
Transactional Leadership

- Motivates followers through rewards and sanctions

- Contingent Reward
  - Clarifies desired outcomes
  - Exchanges rewards and recognition for accomplishments
Transactional Leadership

- Active Management by Exception
  - Selective attention to deviations
  - Corrects problems when detected
  - Sets and enforces rules
Non-Leadership

- Passive Management by Exception
  - Ineffective monitoring of actions
  - Sets standards, waits for problems to arise, then intervenes reluctantly
Non-Leadership

- Laissez-Faire Leadership
  - Frequently absent
  - Indifferent; avoids taking a stand on issues
  - Delays or refrains from intervening: “If it ain’t broke…”
IMPLEMENTATION
CLIMATE
Organizational Climate

• Organizational culture and climate
  ◦ Related but distinct\(^1,2\)

• Organizational climate defined\(^3\)
  ◦ Employees’ perceptions of the policies, practices, and procedures and the kinds of behaviors that get rewarded, supported, and expected in a setting

• Focused or strategic climates
  ◦ Examples: Service, safety
  ◦ Key issue: Alignment
  ◦ Research support

\(^1\text{Denison, 1996}; \ ^2\text{Schneider, Ehrhart, \& Macey, 2010}; \ ^3\text{Schneider, 1990}; \ ^4\text{Kuenzi \& Schminke, 2009}; \ ^5\text{Schneider et al., 2010}\)
Implementation Climate

- **Implementation Climate:**

  - The events, practices, procedures and behaviors that get rewarded, supported and expected towards the goal of effective implementation

- **Implementation Effectiveness:**

  - The consistency and quality of organizational members' initial or early use of a new idea, program, process, practice, or technology\(^1\)

- *Implementation climate predicts implementation effectiveness\(^2\)*

- **Innovation Effectiveness:**

  - The effectiveness of the EBP or innovation that has been implemented\(^1\) (e.g., improved clinical outcomes)

\(^1\)Klein & Sorra, 1996; \(^2\)Klein, Conn & Sorra, 2001
Implementation Climate in Health, Mental Health, and Social Services

- Our team has developed the Implementation Climate Assessment

- Assesses multiple dimensions:
  - Implementation climate
  - Leadership for implementation

- Can be used for
  - Organizational assessment
  - Training
  - Benchmarking organization progress
  - Supporting EBP implementation
Staff Acceptance of EBP

- I am happy to do my part to make evidence-based practice effective at this program.

- I think this program made a good decision in implementing evidence-based practice.
Supporting Staff Use of EBP

- If employees have a problem when using evidence-based practice, they can easily find someone to help them.

- Helpful books and manuals are available when employees have problems with evidence-based practice.
Educational Support for EBP

• This program conducts internal research and/or provides data regarding evidence-based practice.

• This program provides guests speakers presenting about evidence-based practices.
Program/Agency Focus on EBP

- Using evidence-based practices is a top priority in this program/agency.

- People in this program/agency put a lot of effort into making evidence-based practices a priority.
Recruitment/Selection for EBP

- This agency actively recruits staff who have previously used evidence-based practice.

- This program selects staff who value evidence-based practice.
Recognition and Rewards for EBP Use

- Clinicians that use evidence-based practices are held in high esteem in this program.

- This program rewards the use of evidence-based practice.
Leader Knowledge of EBP

- My supervisor is knowledgeable about evidence-based practice.

- My supervisor is able to answer my questions regarding evidence-based practice.
Leader Support for EBP

- My supervisor recognizes and appreciates employee efforts toward successful implementation of evidence-based practice.

- My supervisor helps me decide how to apply evidence-based practice to the individual needs of my clients.
Leader Attention to Staff Buy-in and use of EBP

- My supervisor allocates resources to the implementation of evidence-based practice.

- My supervisor monitors how the implementation of evidence-based practice is going.
Leader Attitudes toward EBP

- My supervisor is strongly committed to the successful implementation of evidence-based practice.

- My supervisor takes an active interest in evidence-based practices problems and successes.
Leader Readiness for EBP Implementation

- My supervisor has a plan to address implementation of evidence-based practices.
- My supervisor understands what it takes to implement evidence-based practices.
APPLYING LEADERSHIP TO IMPLEMENTATION
From Leadership to Implementation Climate

Organizational Culture

Leadership

Climate Embedding Mechanisms

Implementation Climate

Organizational Climate
Climate Embedding Mechanisms

- Climate embedding mechanisms\(^1\)
  - What leaders pay attention to, measure, control
  - How leaders react to critical incidents, crises
  - How leaders allocate resources, rewards, status
  - Role modeling, teaching, coaching
  - How leaders recruit, select, promote

\(^1\)Schein, 2004
Strategies to Support EBP Implementation Climate

What leaders pay attention to, measure and control:

- Regularly “talk up” EBP and get excited about it
  - Inspirational Motivation
- Monitor the use of EBP
  - Management-by-Exception Active
- Include the use of EBP in the team or agency mission
  - Inspirational Motivation
- Tie in the importance of proven effectiveness to the larger goal of improving client services
  - Inspirational Motivation
- Discuss the benefits of using EBP to show that you value EBP
  - Idealized Influence
Strategies to Support EBP Implementation Climate

- How leaders react to critical incidents:
  - React to crises during implementation by effectively problem-solving and engaging staff
    - Intellectual Stimulation
  - Highlight or downplay the importance of a given incident
    - Idealized Influence
  - Engage the team in problem solving to support the use of the EBP
    - Intellectual Stimulation
  - Admit when things are puzzling and not going as expected
    - Idealized Influence
  - Create a learning oriented approach and invite other’s input
    - Intellectual Stimulation
Strategies to Support EBP Implementation Climate

- How leaders allocate resources, rewards and status:
  - Provide rewards based on staff’s use of EBP
    - Contingent Reward
  - Make sure that financial resources, books/manuals and essential materials are available during implementation
  - Pay attention to and reward the proper use of EBP
    - Contingent Reward
  - Point out exemplary efforts toward implementation
    - Individualized Consideration
Strategies to Support EBP Implementation Climate

- Role modeling, teaching and coaching:
  - Spend time coaching staff members individually to improve their understanding and use of EBP
    - Individualized Consideration
  - Ensure that supervisors are knowledgeable about EBP
    - Individualized Consideration, Management-by-Exception Active
  - Have supervisors attend trainings for EBP
    - Individualized Consideration
  - Be a role model of positive attitudes toward EBP
    - Idealized Influence
  - Encourage staff to use supervisors as a resource for working with EBP
    - Individualized Consideration, Intellectual Stimulation
Strategies to Support EBP Implementation Climate

- How leaders recruit, select, promote:
  - Selection at the program and agency level should include looking for prior EBP experience and assessing attitudes toward EBP
    - Inspirational Motivation
  - Identify a team EBP expert to be responsible for answering questions and problem-solving
    - Individualized Consideration
  - Consider the successful use of EBP when making promotion decisions
    - Contingent Reward
Summary of Leadership that Supports Implementation

- Pay close attention to the implementation of EBP and regularly communicate your enthusiasm to staff.
- Utilize critical incidents during implementation to engage staff and promote EBP.
- Recognize and reward staff efforts and successes during EBP implementation.
- Be a role model and a resource for your staff regarding EBP and implementation.
- Consider EBP implementation when hiring and promoting staff.

The Challenge of Leading Effective Health Care

- Take responsibility for implementing the best evidence in clinical services
  - This is “ethical” leadership

- To best serve clients and patients…
  - Take a stand for quality care – it is the ethical thing to do
  - Apply the best approaches to clinical care
  - Apply the best approaches to leading change

- The Ultimate Goals
  - Constantly improve our approach to health care
  - Improve our client’s/patient’s lives
Activity

IMPLEMENTATION PLAN
Implementation Plan

• Creating a more positive implementation climate in your organization

• Step One-
  ◦ Identify an organizational change you have been involved in or is upcoming
  ◦ Identify strengths and barriers

• Step Two-
  ◦ Develop specific strategies for developing an implementation climate that supports your organizational change
  ◦ How can you capitalize on strengths and overcome barriers?
  ◦ Utilize the concepts discussed today
IMPLEMENTATION LEADERSHIP TRAINING
Background and Development

- Leadership and Practice (LEAP)
  - Supported by the National Institute of Mental Health (NIMH)
  - Based in implementation science
  - Adapted from the Full Range Leadership Model
Leadership and Practice (LEAP)

- Evidence-based training
- Developed by experts in leadership, management, health care and mental health
- Designed for healthcare, mental health, and social service organizations and managers
- Measurable results with regular feedback
- Meaningful outcomes
- Supportive peer network
**LEAP training timeline**

- **360° Team Surveys**

- **Initial and Follow-Up Trainings**

- **Agency Visits: Strategy Development with Management Team**

- **Individual Weekly Coaching Calls and Monthly Collaborative Trainee Calls**
Ongoing LEAP Activities

- Research on effective leadership
  - Large and small scale studies

- Organizational surveys
  - Leadership
  - Organizational issues (satisfaction, etc.)

- Comprehensive training

- In-services

- Workshops

- Evaluation

- Consultation
Contact Information

- implementationleadership@gmail.com
- http://www.implementationleadership.com

- Gregory A. Aarons, Ph.D.
  - gaarons@ucsd.edu
  - (858) 966-7703 x3550

- Mark Ehrhart, Ph.D.
  - mehrhart@sunstroke.sdsu.edu
  - (619) 594-4439

- Lauren R. Dlugosz, B.A.
  - ldlugosz@ucsd.edu
  - (858) 966-7703 x7149